

GOVERNOR ALEXANDER O. BRODIE AND ARIZONA'S FIGHT FOR STATEHOOD

By Charles H. Herner

Before a group of some fifty spectators in the executive chamber of the Arizona capitol building in Phoenix on the morning of July 1, 1902, Alexander Oswald Brodie stepped forward to take oath of office as the 15th governor of the Territory of Arizona. Although not a politician in a traditional sense, Brodie had been intermittently involved in the Territory's affairs for over thirty years, first as an army officer and later as a civil and mining engineer.

Highly respected by both Democrats and Republicans, the new Governor presented two important attributes. First, he had a long-standing record of advocating statehood for Arizona and second, his close personal friend, Theodore Roosevelt, now occupied the White House.

The son of Scots immigrants, Brodie was born in 1849 in the small hamlet of Edwards, New York, where his father owned a farm and operated a successful mercantile endeavor. According to family tradition, at the outbreak of the Civil War in 1861, twelve-year-old-Alexander attempted to join the Union Army as a drummer boy. Unable to secure parental permission, however, he finally agreed to a family compromise. In exchange for his father's promise to secure for his son an appointment to the United States Military Academy, Alexander agreed to pursue a formal education at St. Lawrence University in Canton, New York, until he reached 16, the minimum age of admission to the Academy.¹

At West Point, Brodie put together a checkered record. He performed reasonably well academically, but a youthful tendency to rebel

against authority often resulted in disciplinary actions. Nevertheless, upon graduation in 1870, he ranked 27th in a class of 58.²



Alexander O. Brodie

Assigned to M Troop, First Cavalry, upon graduation, Brodie spent the next two and a half years at Camp Apache in the White Mountains of eastern Arizona. Detailed as post adjutant during much of that period, he saw very little field duty, but on one occasion he led a small detachment of soldiers in pursuit of a group of Apaches who had stolen a number of the garrison's horses and mules. He also served without particular distinction in Colonel

(Brevet General) George Crook's famous 1872-73 campaign into the Tonto Basin.³

Departing Arizona with his troop early in 1873, Brodie spent four years billeted at duty stations in the Pacific Northwest. In 1876, at Fort Walla Walla, Washington Territory, Brodie, promoted now to first lieutenant, married a popular local belle, nineteen-year old Kate Reynolds. The following year at Fort Colville, Washington, the young woman died in childbirth, followed in death a few weeks

later by her infant daughter. Completely devastated by the twin tragedies, Brodie resigned his commission.⁴

He then joined his father in a cattle ranching venture in Kansas, but soon turned his attention to mining. Eventually, he found employment as assistant engineer with the Walnut Grove Water Storage Company, a New York-based firm that had just completed a large masonry dam for placer mining purposes on the Hassayampa River a few miles south of Prescott.

The following year, the president of the Walnut Grove Water Storage Company, Henry S. Van Beuren of New York, visibly impressed with Brodie's ability to get things done, promoted him to chief engineer and superintendent of the entire Hassayampa River project.

The Walnut Grove Dam Collapses

On a cold January night in 1890, however, following a period of unusually heavy rainfall, the 110 foot high masonry structure suddenly collapsed. Approximately 60 persons living in the flood plain downstream lost their lives in the ensuing flood. The ever-optimistic Van Beuren planned to rebuild immediately, but upon failing to raise the required capital, instead filed for voluntary bankruptcy and arranged to have the reliable Brodie named receiver with a monthly stipend.⁵

Confident now that he had a future in Yavapai County, Brodie married Miss Mary Hanlon, a survivor of the Walnut Grove flood and a distant relative of Henry Van Beuren. The couple set up housekeeping in Prescott and became active in the local social life. In addition to his duties as receiver, Brodie also continued to supervise development of the Crown Point mine, a promising gold deposit that he and Van Beuren acquired from a local prospector. He also became involved in community affairs and began dabbling in local Republican Party politics.⁶

In 1891, Brodie took his first small step into the political arena by accepting appointment as the first colonel of the newly authorized Arizona National Guard. He resigned within a year, however, after President William Henry Harrison appointed a new governor, Nathan Oakes Murphy. Brodie knew Murphy well, but the two had a political disagreement, and Brodie chose to terminate his association with the Murphy administration.

The following year, Brodie easily won election on the Republican ticket as the Yavapai County recorder, but two years later declined to seek reelection. Although Brodie at the time sought no other political office, he continued to serve on the Republican central committee at both the county and territorial level.

The outbreak of the Spanish-American War in 1898 opened a window of opportunity that dramatically changed Brodie's future. As war clouds began gathering early that year, Brodie concocted a plan to organize a cavalry regiment composed of Arizona cowboys with himself as colonel and offer its services to the War Department. The Secretary of War turned that proposal down, but immediately following the declaration of war on April 25, authorized not one but three volunteer regiments configured exactly as Brodie had proposed.

The "Rough Riders" Are Formed

To command the first of these special regiments, President McKinley named Col. Leonard Wood and Lt. Col. Theodore Roosevelt. Brodie accepted the position of senior major in command of the First Squadron consisting of three troops (companies) from Arizona and one from Oklahoma Territory. Officially designated the First United States Volunteer Cavalry, Colonel Wood's command quickly fired the romantic imagination of the American people, who quickly and fondly came to refer to Wood's regiment as "The Rough Riders."

ers.”⁷

That summer, as the war with Spain drew to a close, the Rough Riders, veterans of the Santiago campaign, moved from Cuba to a temporary camp at Montauk Point, Long Island, to be discharged. Meanwhile, a group of reform-oriented Arizona Republicans made their move.

Brodie Becomes Territorial Delegate

Convinced that Brodie, who had been wounded in Cuba, offered the best hope to wrest the position of Territorial Delegate to Congress away from the Democrats in the 1898 election, these would-be reformers dispatched an envoy to meet with Brodie at Montauk Point and test the waters. The identity of this individual is not known, but obviously he had been well briefed and empowered to make certain concessions, for the situation actually was much more complicated than it appeared. Basically, the problem hinged on Governor Nathan Oakes Murphy's take on Brodie's nomination.

Governor Murphy had entrenched himself as an effective “party boss” in a true sense of the expression. Capitalizing primarily on his political contacts in Washington, Murphy masterfully utilized party patronage to maintain control in Arizona. Yet, some dissention existed in the ranks, and reform Republicans already were chipping away at Murphy's influence. Arizona Democrats, of course, united in their opposition to the Murphy machine, watched from the wings with more than casual interest. Clearly, Brodie was on the brink of stepping into a political quagmire but, by the same token, he was going in with both eyes open.

Details surrounding the arrangements worked out between the Brodie and Murphy factions never have been made public, but the sequence of events reveals certain clues regarding the “horse trading” which obviously took place. For his part, Brodie, concerned that

Murphy could negatively impact the election by withholding support for his candidacy, insisted that his nomination at the Arizona nominating convention be accepted by acclamation. He also insisted that Murphy agree to actively campaign on Brodie's behalf.

Conversely, Brodie agreed to support the Republican opposition to “Free Silver” and to endorse the gold standard. This concession proved to be an extremely bitter pill for Brodie to swallow. For nearly ten years he had been actively involved in Arizona mining and, as expected, on numerous occasions had openly expressed his support for the Free Silver movement. Finally, as part of the agreement, Brodie agreed to stay with his wife and son at his sister-in-law's home in Nova Scotia until after the Arizona convention made its selection. He then would embark for Arizona cast in the role of a wounded war hero returning home in response to the will of the people.⁸

Events at the Arizona nominating convention proceeded exactly as planned. George D. Christy nominated Brodie in a rousing speech. Following an equally enthusiastic second to the nomination, a delegate from Pima County jumped to his feet and moved that Brodie's nomination be accepted by standing vote, thereby assuring the agreed-upon nomination by acclamation.

Christie's speech, however, did more than select the candidate. It also set the tone for Brodie's campaign: “Give us Col. Brodie as our standard bearer and we will sweep every county from the Mexican border to the snow capped peaks of the San Franciscos,” Christy thundered, “and place Arizona in the Republican column to stay, and a new star shall appear in the blue of our banner.” In reality, however, advocating statehood at this point afforded the Republicans little more than a “me too” proposition, as the Democrats in their platform also championed that issue.

The Republicans simply argued that a Brodie victory at the polls in November would offer the best hope for statehood.

Returning to Arizona from Halifax immediately after wiring his acceptance of the Republican nomination as Arizona's lone delegate to Congress, Brodie launched an energetic campaign designed to reach as many voters as possible. But his pitch for statehood failed to connect. His opponent, John F. Wilson, prevailed 8,212 votes to 7,384. Deeply disappointed, Brodie returned to the Crown Point mine. The following year, however, the floundering statehood issue, so near and dear to the hearts of most Arizonans, received a totally unexpected shot in the arm.

Roosevelt Raises Statehood Hopes

In June 1899, the First Annual Reunion of the Rough Riders convened in Las Vegas, New Mexico. Both Brodie and Roosevelt, who had narrowly been elected governor of New York the previous year, attended. Roosevelt thoroughly enjoyed the festivities and on one occasion, in a speech accepting a medal of appreciation presented on behalf of the citizens of New Mexico, made an impromptu remark with far-reaching implications. "All I can say is," a veteran court stenographer carefully quoted him, "if New Mexico wants to be a state you can count me in and I will go to Washington to speak for you or anything you wish." Roosevelt's statement, of course, would not soon be forgotten in New Mexico and in Arizona.⁹

The presidential election the following year offered a mixed bag to statehood watchers. On one hand President William McKinley, winner of a second term, did not have an established track record of supporting statehood for Arizona, but on the other, his newly-selected vice president, the former governor of New York, Theodore Roosevelt, seemed to have a much more favorable view of the issue as he had publicly expressed at Las Vegas.

Moreover, the national platform of both major parties in 1900 supported statehood for Arizona, New Mexico and Oklahoma.

The situation changed dramatically in September 1901, when an obscure anarchist shot down President McKinley, thereby unexpectedly thrusting Theodore Roosevelt into the White House. Nine months later, President Roosevelt accepted Governor Murphy's resignation and appointed his old comrade-in-arms, Alexander Oswald Brodie, in his place.¹⁰

Initially, at least from Brodie's perspective, his appointment as Governor in July 1902 came at the most opportune moment possible regarding statehood. Only two months earlier, the U.S. House of Representatives, with almost no opposition, had passed the so-called Omnibus Bill, which authorized Arizona, New Mexico and Oklahoma each to draft constitutions and apply for statehood. Obviously, with Congress apparently now coming in line and considering Roosevelt's 1898 remark in Las Vegas, statehood no longer appeared to be a will-o'-the-wisp. Unfortunately, any attending euphoria soon vanished as reality took center stage.

Senator Beveridge Gets Involved

Strong support for the Omnibus Bill in the Senate came at the hands of the powerful Matthew S. Quay of Pennsylvania, but the chairman of the Senate Committee of Territories, Albert J. Beveridge of Indiana, orchestrated a determined fight in opposition. Motivated by the Free Silver issue and fear that Arizona and New Mexico would enter the Union as Democratic States, Beveridge swung into action. Realizing, however, that Quay had strong bipartisan support for the Omnibus Bill, Beveridge concluded that he faced an uphill fight in the Senate, and that his best chance to kill the measure would be in his committee. Therefore, in an effort to gain time and line up opposition, Beveridge

arranged to take three members of his committee on a “fact finding” tour of Arizona, New Mexico and Oklahoma in the fall of 1902 to determine if those territories deserved statehood.¹¹

Meanwhile, Governor Brodie already had moved aggressively to make his own position clear. In his first annual report to the Secretary of the Interior completed shortly after taking office in 1902, Brodie enumerated ten specific recommendations relative to Arizona. Significantly, the first on the list focused on statehood. “Arizona’s claims to statehood [should] be given due consideration,” Brodie pleaded, “and that such as lies within the power of the Interior Department be extended to secure the passage of the enabling act now before the Congress of the United States for the admission of Arizona, New Mexico and Oklahoma . . .” With his position on statehood clearly established as a matter of public record, Brodie began preparation for Beveridge’s visit.¹²

The Beveridge “Fact Finding” Mission

Beveridge’s “fact finding” mission actually did not resonate well with Brodie, particularly after the Senator ignored Brodie’s offer to help arrange the trip and turned for assistance instead to ex-Governor Murphy’s brother Frank, who owned the Santa Fe, Phoenix and Prescott Railway. Brodie traveled from Phoenix to Bisbee with Beveridge’s group, doing all he could to present Arizona in the best possible light. Significantly, Beveridge spent only three days in Arizona interviewing selected residents—sometimes in private—and visiting such institutions as the University of Arizona, the Congress mine and the immense Phelps Dodge mining complex at Bisbee.¹³

Released in December, Beveridge’s report, as Brodie anticipated, concluded that neither Arizona nor New Mexico met the qualifications for statehood. Among other objections, Beveridge claimed that both territories had an

inordinate number of residents who spoke only Spanish. Moreover, neither Arizona nor New Mexico had the capability of sustaining the necessary economic growth which statehood would require. Notwithstanding Beveridge’s negative report, however, the fight was far from over. Senator Quay dug in his heels and pledged to continue the struggle. Others joined the fray, as well, and ex-Governor Murphy already had gone to Washington to lobby personally for statehood. Nevertheless, Brodie now faced a difficult decision that would sorely test his acumen as a politician.¹⁴

Brodie Has Second Thoughts

Notwithstanding his long public reputation of supporting statehood, Brodie by the end of 1902, was beginning to have second thoughts on the issue. He still supported the basic concept, but in his view the timing was wrong. Arizona had not yet recovered from five years of drought, which had left both the cattle and agricultural interests in dire straights. The mining industry continued to flourish, but even so Brodie concluded that statehood at this particular point in time would impose an “additional burden of expense” which Arizona as a state could not readily absorb.

Given his position as Governor and past statements he had made regarding statehood, however, Brodie understood full well that he could not articulate his reservations regarding statehood publicly. To do so would destroy his credibility by revealing that a clear schism existed between his private opinions and the public commitments he had made earlier. Obviously, he had no choice but to choke back his own personal feelings and continue to push for statehood.¹⁵

Fortunately, another issue suddenly surfaced which took Brodie off the hook. In December, some Congressmen, apparently motivated by fear that the acrimonious positions taken by Quay and Beveridge could result in a Con-

gressional deadlock, suggested that Congress consider joining New Mexico and Arizona into one state and Oklahoma and the Indian Territory into another. Brodie may have been perfectly willing to accept a delay in granting statehood to Arizona, but he absolutely opposed joint statehood with New Mexico. In that regard, he obviously concurred wholeheartedly with one Arizona newspaper, which dismissed joint statehood as a “preposterous idea.”¹⁶

Joint AZ/NM Statehood Considered

For the next two years, the statehood issue continued to languish in Washington. During that period, a number of bills proposing that Arizona and New Mexico be admitted as one state ground their way to a slow death in Congress. Most died in committee. One of the most intriguing measures suggested that such a state be named “Montezuma,” but that idea got no farther than did the others.

Brodie never gave up the fight and publicly opposed joint statehood at every opportunity. At one point he even called upon each Arizona county board of supervisors and local boards of trade to petition Congress in opposition. In his 1904 Annual Report to the Secretary of the Interior, the Governor expressed himself even more strongly on the issue than he had before. “The people of Arizona have protested vigorously,” Brodie wrote, “and will continue to do so until they have defeated the repugnant scheme. The injustice of it should readily appeal to all.”¹⁷

In reality, however, Arizona’s immediate future had been decided the year before at the Grand Canyon.

Obviously, the key to unlocking independent statehood for Arizona remained securely tucked away in President Roosevelt’s pocket. Many individuals attempted to ascertain the President’s position, but none could cut through his ambiguous statements and secure a definitive response. Even his good friend

Brodie could not elicit a clear answer. In fact, the extant correspondence between Roosevelt and Brodie regarding statehood is remarkable for its paucity. At one point, Brodie even directly asked Roosevelt to support the Omnibus Bill then before Congress, but there is no evidence that Roosevelt even replied to Brodie’s letter of request.¹⁸

Unable to secure a firm written commitment from Roosevelt, Brodie turned to a tactic that had served him well in the past. He intended to raise the issue in a forthcoming face-to-face meeting with the President. An exceedingly private man by nature, Brodie worked very effectively behind the scenes, as he once confided to George Smalley, who had asked for help in securing a postmaster’s position. “Let me know the day you are going to send your papers [application] in and I will get in a personal letter to the President on your behalf,” Brodie promised: “This latter keep to yourself as it is a way I have of landing things and I don’t wish it known.” The point is that Roosevelt may well have desired to avoid making a definite commitment to Brodie regarding statehood, but the close friendship between the two Rough Riders quite possibly could override that desire.¹⁹

Roosevelt Visit Provides an Opportunity

Brodie’s opportunity to thrash out the statehood issue with the President personally came in May 1903. The year before, Roosevelt had planned a political junket across the nation, intending to visit every state and territory in the Far West. But an accident forced him to postpone the Western portion of his trip until the following spring. Upon being informed that Roosevelt would visit Arizona in May, Brodie immediately requested that Roosevelt spend two days in Arizona. The President replied that he could schedule only one day in Arizona to view the Grand Canyon, but as an alternative to Brodie’s request, Roosevelt pressured Brodie to join the President’s party at Albuquerque and travel with his group by

train as far as the Grand Canyon. He also requested that Brodie be prepared to accompany the President alone on a horseback ride along the southern rim of the Canyon. Brodie, of course, jumped at this opportunity to spend at least several hours alone with Roosevelt, enabling him to discuss the statehood issue and other matters in depth and in private.

Roosevelt's scheduled visit to the Grand Canyon turned into a festive occasion.

Over 1000 spectators—including a number of Arizona Rough Riders—gathered to greet the President and cheer his remarks. Roosevelt talked at length about the beauty of the Canyon and the necessity to preserve it. And, of course, he also praised the Arizona Rough Riders for their performance in

Cuba. Roosevelt's speech was extremely well received, and no one, with the obvious exception of Brodie, seemed to notice that the President failed to even mention statehood. Was that a calculated omission? Brodie later suggested it might well have been.²⁰

In some respects, 1904 stands as the high water mark of the Brodie Administration. That year, President Roosevelt resolved the long-festering Stoddard matter to Brodie's satisfaction, and the Murphy brothers orchestrated their last futile attempt to wrest control of the Arizona Republican Party from their archrival, Governor Brodie. The party's nominating convention served as the battleground for that final power play. Scheduled to convene in Tucson in March, the convention had the responsibility of selecting six delegates to

represent Arizona at the national Republican convention in Chicago, where the Republican presidential candidate for the general election that fall would be named.²¹

On the surface, Roosevelt appeared to have the nomination in his pocket, but some Republicans still hoped they could steal the nomination for Senator Mark Hanna of Ohio by striking some kind of a deal with unin-



President Roosevelt, Governor Brodie and other dignitaries pose at the Grand Canyon.

structed convention delegates in the proverbial smoke-filled back room in Chicago. Brodie, absolutely determined that the Arizona delegation would not be a party to any such skullduggery, insisted that the delegates be instructed at Tucson to vote only for Roosevelt. On the other hand, Frank Murphy, acting leader of the "Old Guard" wing of the party in

Arizona during his brother's absence, argued that Arizona should send uninstructed delegates to Chicago who then would be free to "act for the best interests of the Territory." Murphy continued to cling to that position even after Hanna died of typhoid on February 15, 1904. Consequently, the issue remained a divisive test of power between Murphy and Brodie to be resolved at the Tucson party convention.²²

As the returns from the various county nominating conventions began rolling into Phoenix, it quickly became apparent that Brodie's supporters easily controlled the county elections, and that a strong pro-Roosevelt element dominated the territorial convention. At the last moment, however, the New Mexico delegate to Congress, Bernard S. Rodey, released

to the press a pair of telegrams stating that Roosevelt now actively supported a plan to combine Arizona and New Mexico into one state. Stunned by Rodey's allegations, Brodie quickly wired William Loeb, Roosevelt's private secretary, to determine the validity of Rodey's claim. Unfortunately, with no reply from Loeb yet in hand, Brodie had no choice but to face the delegates gathered in Tucson and address Rodey's allegations as best he could.²³

If Delegate Rodey released his telegrams in an effort to embarrass both Brodie and Roosevelt at the Tucson convention, his timing could not have been better. But Brodie was ready. On March 8, he took the convention floor in response to Rodey's allegations. Speaking calmly and unemotionally, Brodie addressed Rodey's comments directly. "For some days telegrams have been flying around the country stating that the President was using his influence for joint statehood," Brodie began, and "I have never believed for an instant that the President has authorized such a statement."

That established, Brodie then described his long trip with Roosevelt from Albuquerque to the Grand Canyon in 1903. During that tour, Brodie assured the delegates, he had made it absolutely clear to the President that "the people of Arizona were unanimous for single statehood or none." Roosevelt had responded with the observation that he "had never taken a stand in statehood matters," leaving that decision solely in the hands of Congress. By implication, then, Roosevelt and Brodie had come to a convenient agreement that Congress would determine Arizona's future without presidential interference.²⁴

Satisfied with Brodie's explanation, the delegates responded with a thunderous ovation and quickly elected Brodie and five other delegates to the Republican National 1904 Nominating Convention in Chicago. They

were instructed to vote for Roosevelt.

Following the presidential election of 1904, the statehood issue continued to smolder quietly. Roosevelt now owed the continuation of his presidency to the ballot box as opposed to an assassin's bullet, but his position on statehood for Arizona and New Mexico had not changed significantly. He appeared to be moving closer to accepting joint statehood, but so far had publicly refrained from actually casting the die in that direction. Brodie, of course, remained true to the cause, even requesting the Arizona Legislature to send two memorials to Congress rejecting any plan to join the two territories.

Roosevelt Comes Out For Jointure

Suddenly, however, the situation changed dramatically. In his annual message to Congress in December 1905, President Roosevelt recommended that Arizona and New Mexico be granted joint statehood. Many Arizonans obviously felt that they had been betrayed and vociferously voiced their objections, but Brodie was not among them. Nine months earlier, on February 14, 1905, he had resigned as Governor to accept Roosevelt's offer to appoint him assistant chief of the Records and Pension Bureau of the War Department with the rank of major.²⁵

For a variety of reasons, the exact impact of Brodie's relationship with Roosevelt, as it ultimately affected statehood, is difficult to determine. Obviously, there is no "smoking gun" pointing at any arrangement the two men might have made, but many circumstantial clues exist. The friendship between the two Rough Riders, as forged at Riverside Park in San Antonio and later tempered by Spanish Mausers in the bloody hills of Cuba, established a battlefield camaraderie which the passage of time could only nurture and bond the two men even closer. Needless to say, the two old soldiers trusted each other implicitly. "I have always felt peculiarly

drawn to you,” Roosevelt once wrote his friend, “as a comrade and fellow soldier and as a citizen. You are the kind of American I like to think of as typical of our country.”²⁶

Brodie Walks a Political Tightrope

Obviously a loyal supporter of Roosevelt from their first meeting in San Antonio, Brodie reliably fit the mold of the good soldier, marching to the beat of the regimental drum without complaining or breaking step. He consistently followed Roosevelt’s instructions to the letter, but at the same time, maintained the freedom to fully and openly express his own position on any given issue until such time as Roosevelt made his final decision. The question of Arizona statehood is a perfect example of that arrangement.

In some ways, statehood at the turn of the century for Arizona and neighboring New Mexico at first appeared to be a unifying factor between Brodie and Roosevelt, but in reality that proved not to be the case. As Roosevelt settled into the White House following McKinley’s death, he realized that his party stood badly divided on the statehood issue, which threatened to help disrupt his efforts to unify the GOP behind his presidential bid in 1904. Concluding, therefore, that he had to tread carefully on the issue, Roosevelt vacillated on making his wishes known until after the election of that year. On the other hand, Governor Brodie took an uncompromising stance on the matter, immediately championing without reservation the position of Arizona residents, who wanted separate statehood and wanted it now. Obviously, Roosevelt could have stopped Brodie’s activities at any point, but significantly he did not.

The meeting Roosevelt requested between himself and Brodie at the Grand Canyon in May 1903 appears to have been the occasion where the two laid out their strategy. The plan really was quite simple. Brodie would freely continue to demand separate statehood,

which would be critical in his efforts to ensure that the Arizona Republican Party rejected the Old Guard and supported the Roosevelt wing of the party. In other words, Brodie could pressure Congress in any way he desired without fear that Roosevelt would enter the fight publicly. For his part of the agreement, of course, Roosevelt agreed to leave the statehood question in the hands of Congress and refrain from making any public statement endorsing joint statehood, which obviously would embarrass Brodie and harm his efforts to build a pro-Roosevelt Party in Arizona. The plan succeeded. Brodie and his supporters beat back the joint statehood crowd in Congress and Roosevelt successfully brought the Old Guard to heel in preparation for the 1904 election. The following year, with Brodie back in the army and reelection accomplished, Roosevelt publicly asked Congress to join Arizona with New Mexico, something that he apparently had wanted to do all along.

In the final analysis, then, Brodie actually accomplished virtually nothing to achieve statehood for Arizona during President Roosevelt’s first term in office, but he played a key role in rejecting joint statehood with New Mexico. It is quite likely that without Governor Brodie’s activities, the state of “Montezuma,”—or something similar—would have entered the Union before Roosevelt left office in 1909.



ENDNOTES

¹ Interview with Mary DeLanie, Alexander O. Brodie’s granddaughter, April 13, 1963, Flagstaff, Arizona.

² Constance Wynn Altshuler, *Cavalry Yellow and Infantry Blue: Army officers in Arizona Between 1851 and 1886* (Tucson: Arizona Historical Society, 1991), pp. 43-44.

³ Maj. John Green to Assistant Adjutant General (AAG), Department of Arizona, May 6, 1871, Letters Received by the Office of Indian Affairs, 1824-1881,

Arizona Superintendency, 1870-1871, Record Group (RG) 75, National Archives, (NA). Assuming command of the Department of Arizona in 1871, Lt. Col. and Brevet Maj. Gen. Crook established a well-deserved reputation as an effective Indian fighter. His 1872-73 campaign into the Tonto Basin is well known in Arizona.

⁴ Altshuler, *Cavalry Yellow*, pp. 43-44.

⁵ David B. Dill, Jr., "Terror on the Hassayampa: The Walnut Grove Dam Disaster of 1890," *The Journal of Arizona History*, vol 28 (Autumn 1987), pp. 283-306. A native of New York born in 1834, Henry Spinger Van Beuren and four siblings inherited an estate valued at \$13,000,000.

⁶ Altshuler, *Cavalry Yellow*, pp. 43-44. Mary Hanlon, a close friend and frequent traveling companion of Van Beuren's daughter, Nell, was visiting Walnut Grove with the Van Beurens when the dam collapsed. She left a gripping account of her narrow escape from flood water roaring down the canyon below the dam.

⁷ Charles Herner, *The Arizona Rough Riders*, (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1970), pp. 14-15. *Ibid.*, pp. 10-38. Contrary to a local erroneous legend that probably never will die, the plans to raise a regiment of cowboy cavalry in Arizona actually originated with Brodie and not with William Owen "Buckey" O'Neill. O'Neill, however, did assist Brodie in recruiting men from northern Arizona.

⁸ Prescott *Weekly Courier*, September 9, 1898. The term "Free Silver" refers to a concept championed by the Populist Party and later in 1896 by the Democratic Party to use silver on an unlimited basis to back up the nation's currency. Support for the idea snowballed in those states and territories with a viable mining industry such as Arizona. Brodie reportedly even declined the Republican nomination for Yavapai County treasurer in 1896 because he refused to support the gold standard as the Republican Party demanded.

⁹ Newspaper clipping in Folder: "1899 Rough Rider Reunion," James H. McClintock Papers, Phoenix Public Library.

¹⁰ Apparently, Roosevelt decided to replace Governor Murphy largely because he openly opposed one of Roosevelt's pet projects, the National Reclamation Act, which happened to be highly popular in water-starved Arizona.

¹¹ John Braeman, "Albert J. Beveridge and Statehood for the Southwest, 1902-1912," *Arizona and the West*, vol. 10 (Winter 1968), pp. 313-340.

¹² *Report of the Governor of Arizona to the Secretary of the Interior for the Year Ended June 30, 1902* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1902). Although Brodie took office on July 1, 1902, it fell upon him to complete the governor's report for the previous year.

¹³ Braeman, "Albert J. Beveridge and Statehood," pp.

313-340.

¹⁴ *Ibid.* Beveridge's report to Congress reveals that he harbored strong anti-Hispanic sentiments.

¹⁵ George H. Smalley to his father, January 23, 1903, Folder 5, Box 1, George Smalley Papers, Arizona Historical Society (AHS), Tucson. Born in 1872 in Wisconsin, George Smalley came to Arizona in 1896. As a reporter for the *Arizona Republican*, he covered Brodie's 1898 campaign for delegate to Congress. The two became friends, and, after becoming governor, Brodie appointed Smalley his private secretary.

¹⁶ *Phoenix Arizona Gazette*, December 14, 1902.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, February 22, 1903; *Report of the Governor of Arizona to the Secretary of the Interior for the Year Ended June 30, 1904* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1904).

¹⁸ Governor Brodie to President Roosevelt, November 15, 1902, "Governor's Office," Record Group 1, Alexander Oswald Brodie, 1902-1905, Letters of Governor Brodie, July 1, 1902-March 19, 1903, Book 1, Arizona State Library and Archives, Phoenix.

¹⁹ Brodie to George Smalley, January 2, 1902, Folder 1, Box 1, Smalley Papers, AHS. Brodie's admission to Smalley of his influence with Roosevelt is just one example of his close relationship with Roosevelt.

²⁰ Unidentified newspaper clipping, Governor Brodie's Scrapbook, Author's Files.

²¹ Arizona Secretary of State Isaac Taft Stoddard had been appointed to that position by President McKinley. Suspected by many in Arizona of being corrupt, Stoddard and Governor Brodie quickly became involved in a bitter fight over the disposition of territorial incorporation fees.

²² *Phoenix Arizona Republican*, February 2, 3, 1904; *Phoenix Enterprise*, January 12, 1904. A native of Ohio and one of the most powerful members of the Republican Party, Marc (Mark) Hanna did not always see eye to eye with Roosevelt.

²³ *Phoenix Arizona Republican*, March 9, 1904. An Irish-born politician, Rodey came to New Mexico in 1881. Elected delegate to Congress in 1900, he championed separate statehood until 1904, when he changed his position for unknown reasons. The origin and authenticity of the telegrams released by Rodey has not been determined.

²⁴ *Ibid.*

²⁵ Robert W. Larsen, *New Mexico's Quest for Statehood, 1840-1912* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1968) pp. 226-235.

²⁶ Roosevelt to Brodie, April 20, 1912, Series I, Reel 157, Theodore Roosevelt Papers, Library of Congress.